

Interim Report for NSF ADVANCE Program, April 15-August 31
Lehigh ADVANCE: Building Community Beyond Academic Departments
Due (Saturday) 9-1-2012, Submitted (Tuesday) 9-4-2012

I. Significant Accomplishments: Project Activities

A. Social Science Research: Gender and Interdisciplinarity

Since the completion of the 2nd Annual Report in April, 2012, the Social Science Research Team of Diane Hyland, Jackie Krasas, and Wendy Abrantes, together with a consulting statistician, has completed in-depth analyses of the responses from 10 research-intensive mid-sized universities to answer our research questions about gender and interdisciplinary research. From a detailed initial results report, a manuscript exploring the hypothesis that women benefit from interdisciplinary environments (including examining affiliation with centers and programs independent of and together with departments is in a draft and targeted for submission to *Sex Roles*. Two additional papers are planned. One focuses on the analysis of work-life balance questions as they related to conducting interdisciplinary and collaborative scholarship, and the other involves a more structural approach, taking into consideration important institutional factors (the existence of certain policies, whether the school is an ADVANCE institution, the proportion of women in a home department).

The report of the BASELINE survey was made available to Lehigh-credentialed users on the ADVANCE website after resolving a web-based application conflict.

Key findings continue to be shared in appropriate venues; including discussions with colleges, departments, upcoming Chairs Breakfasts and programs for Search Committee Chairs. Preliminary findings were presented at the AWIS ADVANCE PI meetings last November and at the Sociologists for Women in Society Conference in February. The theme of this conference was "institutional transformation." We anticipate a poster or presentation at the next ADVANCE PI meeting (Nov. 2012).

B. Women in Science and Engineering (LU-WISE) and Lehigh Open Access Database (iWISSEN)

Throughout the summer, LU-WISE continued to prepare for the expansion to the Lehigh Valley region. We expect LVAIC (Lehigh Valley Association of Independent Colleges) faculty to participate in WISE programs starting in Fall 2012. Two or three LU-WISE luncheons will be scheduled, their dates are forthcoming

The development of the iWISSEN database was previously stalled because of issues with the foundational database (thus far managed by one college) upon which data were to be drawn. Project Manager Marci Levine has worked with College and University level Library Technology Services individuals to determine the path forward: 1) a stand alone database will be required; 2) it can be built with data exported from the existing system; 3) it can be served through the existing ADVANCE website, but only if the website is upgraded from Drupal 6 to Drupal 7; 4) The Drupal 7 upgrade is underway.

C. Women's Studies Program (now "Women, Gender, and Sexuality Program")

The Women's Studies Program continues to have retention gatherings attended by women faculty across the College of Arts and Sciences and RCEAS. This past academic year, we held two per semester with an average gathering size of 12-14 attendees. This year, retention gatherings are planned monthly in the Fall semester. This summer during the June 1, 2012 retreat, the Leadership Team agreed that a useful point of discussion with faculty would be the topic 'gendering of service'. To that point, Dean Donald Hall has agreed to lead a discussion around this topic in Fall 2012 and Dana Briton, Rutgers, has been invited to speak in Spring 2013 to talk about her work on women moving from associate to full professor. The feminist reading group lunch meets twice a semester with 8-12 attendees.

D. Recruitment Strategies

The Vice Provost for Academic Diversity, Henry Odi, meets at least once with every search committee to provide guidance in diversifying the candidate pool and other best practices. This meeting is now a required step in all search processes.

University-Wide Guidebook: In Spring 2012, as a follow-up to the booklet "*Faculty Recruitment: Best Practices for Diversity and Excellence*," (<https://advance.cc.lehigh.edu/sites/advance.cc.lehigh.edu/files/RecruitmentBookletFinal17Aug2011.pdf>) Henry Odi launched a working group charged to produce a university-wide handbook for faculty searches and develop a workshop for all academic department chairs, search committee chairs and staff program coordinators who are involved in faculty searches. Marci Levine provided Henry Odi a compare/contrast of the RCEAS and existing CAS documentation on hiring. A first draft of the harmonized document was reviewed by a working group in July and also by other stakeholders, including the Deans, Legal Counsel, and Human Resources. As recommended from this feedback, a decision was made to use the web to deliver the revised content. The launch of the new electronic university-wide search guidebook is expected to coincide with the first fall 2012 workshop about best practices for hiring faculty.

Workshop:. On September 28, 2012 Lehigh will host The Cornell Interactive Theatre Ensemble ([CITE](#)) as they perform two sessions of the program "**Effective Faculty Search Process -- "It Depends on the Lens": Unconscious Bias in the Faculty Search Process.**" Invited attendees include all department chairs, faculty search committee members, faculty search committee chairs, associate chairs, associate deans, and program directors. The deans have been invited, and the Provost and VPAD will be in attendance as well.

AcademicJobsOnline.com Over the late spring and summer months, the Provost's Office led training for staff and faculty about the new AcademicJobsOnline.com method to electronically track and manage the faculty application and hiring process. Moving to this (or other suitable electronic) online tool will assist in collection of real time affirmative action data so real time observation and decisions about diversity in the applicant pool can be made.

New Idea: Case Studies Discussions: As a follow-up to this workshop program, the Leadership Team and IAC have proposed a case study panel discussion of past searches comparing and contrasting those that were and were not successful in securing a commitment from the top female candidate to whom an offer was made.

The scheduling and selection of cases will be discussed by the LT in September.

Online Mandatory Tutorial for Search Committee Members: During the June 1, 2012 Retreat a new recruitment training deliverable was discussed. Jill Schneider (Professor of Biological Sciences, ADVANCE Chair) agreed to take the lead in formulating the questions (based on several other schools' materials), which could be delivered electronically in time for the majority of searches coming in the next academic year cycle. The College of Business and Economics may not be able to benefit as much from this first iteration of the training because their searches take place over the summer. However the faculty in CBE should be held to the same set of expectations. A draft of questions and discussion of the answers was completed at the time of this report and will be reviewed by the leadership team and university stakeholders. It is expected this tool will supplement and reinforce the lessons learned from the CITE workshop and those encompassed in the University –Wide Handbook.

Ongoing Efforts At the recommendation of the IAC and the EAC, the ADVANCE co-PIs have communicated directly to Deans and Departments that ADVANCE is available as a resource for continuing to understand recruitment best practices and internal data and trends important to decision-making.

2011-2012 Search Outcomes: The Provost has reported that the 2011-2012 faculty search process yielded 11 STEM hires. Of these, five commitments were from women: four will join in 2012-2013 (1 in Physics, 2 in Biological Sciences, 1 in Sociology) and 1 has committed to joining the faculty in 2013-2014 (Mechanical Engineering and Mechanics). The 2012-2013 List of Approved Faculty Searches was sent to the Deans in July and in that message the Provost emphasized ADVANCE, the best practices documentation as well as both the Dual Career hiring policies and the Strategic Bridge Hiring Mechanism. Strategic Bridge Hiring enables departments to plan for a faculty retirement and hire a new faculty member with ½ salary paid by the Provost for three years if the person increases the diversity of the department. Upon that retirement, the department (college) funds the full time position and salary.

E. Lehigh ADVANCE Small Grants Programs

Over the summer, no new awards were requested, although we did field two enquiries about the program (one from a female faculty member in computer science and engineering and one from the Math Department about how to increase the number of women in their colloquia ahead of future faculty searches). We are continuing to advertise both the collaborative/leadership award and the recruitment seminar award programs and discuss their utility with departments, especially as we reinforce the idea of long-range networking to build diverse recruitment pools.

F. Interdisciplinary Networking Committees

The Interdisciplinary Networking Committee (INC) is the Lehigh ADVANCE initiative's mentoring model primarily coordinated through the Deputy Provost for Faculty Affairs office. This office also coordinates the University Faculty Mentoring Committee. At the conclusion of the first year of INCs we evaluated the program. Based on a very good response rate from the 13 INC teams, those who participated (on both sides of the mentoring relationship) felt the INC program was beneficial, though there were recommendations for improvements. These recommendations included having anchoring meetings/events that might include a presentation or panel on a particular topic and then time for each INC to help the newer faculty members work on their personal growth related to that topic. Jean Russo and Marci Levine worked with Vince Munley to incorporate the feedback into 2012-2013 iteration of INCs. In 2012-2013 groups of four are expected to be organized between pairs of new AND existing faculty, not only three senior faculty to one new faculty member. At the start of the 2012-2013 year, 19 new faculty and not yet participating second-year faculty were identified and invited to voluntarily join in the INC program. So far, 10 have responded yes (4 in STEM, 1 STEM woman). Once the INCs are

established for the 2012-2013 cohort, all INC teams will be invited to an Orientation of both mentors and mentees to summarize the program.

In response to feedback of developing an anchoring program, we have agreed with AWIS to host the Mentoring Relationships workshop for mentoring faculty (as one of our “anchoring” events). While AWIS is on campus, they will also be able to deliver a program on mentoring STEM graduate students during which issues of gender and interdisciplinarity will be discussed. This will take place October 10 and Oct 11, 2012 and will be open to all faculty. The mentoring and working with graduate students was previously identified as a topic important to our women STEM faculty in a brief survey about leadership topics.

ADVANCE remains a resource on issues of gender in the academy to the University Faculty Mentoring Committee.

G. Review of Policy/Guidelines on Evaluating Faculty involved in Interdisciplinary Research and Teaching

The Interdisciplinary Policy/Guidelines Review Task Group, also called the Committee on Interdisciplinary Research and Teaching, chaired by Deputy Provost Vincent Munley and including two ADVANCE LT members, two tenured STEM women, and several other faculty, presented their finalized recommendations for policy/guidelines changes to Provost Farrell and the Academic Deans at a Council of Deans meeting on February 28, 2012. The Provost sent the proposal to the Faculty Personnel Committee, which will consider it, consult with others, and then bring proposed policy changes forward for consideration by the entire University faculty before the end of the 2012-2013 academic year.

II. Project Management and Organization

Leadership Team:

In the period since the April 15, 2012 Year Two Annual Report, Marci Levine and other members of the Leadership Team have worked closely with university stakeholders to develop a list of dates suitable for the NSF Third Year Site Visit. The Leadership Team also held a 3.5 hour retreat session on June 1, 2012.

Jeff Sands and Sibel Pamukcu have agreed to remain co-directors through the site visit, after which directorship changes are anticipated. They continue to work closely with Marci Levine, Project Manager. The fall 2012 schedule of ADVANCE business meetings follows the general plan established in 2011, but includes more frequent meetings because of the demands of preparing for the third year site visit. Sixty or ninety minute meetings are scheduled for September 14, October 10, October 24, November 12, November 30 (together with the IAC), December 10, and December 19.

Marci Levine and Pat Farrell (Provost and ADVANCE PI) attended the JAM meeting June 12-15, 2012 at which time sessions about evaluation, sharing institutional data internally, and the third year site visit were very useful. Marci Levine provided a summary of important lessons learned and shared it with the LT and IAC groups.

Internal Advisory Committee: The IAC members met in May and agreed that Jennifer Swann, Professor of Biological Sciences, would serve as their chair. She has met individually and as a group with members of the IAC, LT and the Provost about the IAC’s role and how she can be most effective. The IAC contributed feedback to the LT for their June 1, 2012 LT retreat. The IAC and the LT met together for 90 minutes on August 27.

External Advisory Committee: No arrangements have yet been made for the year three visit of the External Advisory Committee. If we follow the same schedule as last year, the EAC will visit in January 2013, one month prior to the year three site visit. We will finalize plans for the EAC sometime over the next two months. We welcome advice from NSF on this matter.

ADVANCE Chairs: 2012 and 2013 ADVANCE Chairs met about every other Friday and developed a scope, list of targeted speakers and audience categories and Marci has reserved room for the First LVAIC STEM WOMEN SYMPOSIUM on either March 18 or 22, 2013. The Leadership Team approved the scope. This Fall, a new schedule for meetings is set to start and the first step will be drafting and sending invitations to speakers. The 2014 Symposium will also begin to take shape this Fall Semester.

Communications: No significant changes to the extensive detail we provided in the year two annual report. Communication within sub-teams of Lehigh ADVANCE and also from Lehigh ADVANCE to the larger Lehigh community and beyond is important and is increasing the visibility of our programs and mission. Marci works with coordinators and administrators across campus to share important information. A reminder memo to all faculty advertises the availability of the ADVANCE program small grants and the continued availability of the recruitment seminar grants.. The Web Site is updated regularly by Marci Levine.

III. Areas of Difficulty/Resistance

One continuing challenge is the disparate departmental climates at Lehigh, including several STEM departments that are completely or nearly completely male. We believe that open communication and coordinated actions and decisions across all levels of university leadership will be needed to address these issues effectively.

Efforts to interface effectively with academic search committees in STEM are continuing. We hope to have some positive results to report by the time of our next interim report.

The Leadership Development component of Lehigh ADVANCE is in some flux, including new initiatives by the Vice Provost for Academic Diversity and the planning and coordination for the upcoming Academic Symposia.

IV. Best New Ideas/ Online Resource

1. Members of the Lehigh ADVANCE Leadership Team and the Faculty Mentoring Committee agreed that Lehigh ADVANCE can move forward to deliver the AWIS Mentoring Workshop in Fall 2012; it will coincide with additional faculty mentoring support programming.
2. The 2012 and 2013 ADVANCE Chairs have developed a strategy to deliver one small 1-day program (spring 2013) and a larger 2-day program (spring 2014) in place of the 2013 large academic symposium from the original proposal. This will afford the opportunity to build our regional LVAIC community of STEM women in 2013 and expand to include the Mid-Atlantic state region in 2014, while avoiding schedule conflicts with other major University events.
3. Three of the co-PIs (Hyland, Pamukcu, Sands) met individually with all STEM department chairs over the summer for frank discussions about where we are, what is working well, and what needs to be improved. Recruitment of STEM women was identified by some (but not all) chairs as an area in which they still would like more help.

V. Project Evaluation

The internal evaluator worked on two evaluation initiatives since the last report. One was the evaluation of the Interdisciplinary Networking Committee (INC) Program under the direction of Dr. Vincent G. Munley, Deputy Provost for Faculty Affairs. Thirteen first- or second-year faculty members, two of which were STEM women, requested an INC, and the 13 mentees were mentored by 36 senior faculty members. Two luncheons were held in April to have a discussion about and elicit feedback from the faculty mentees and interdisciplinary mentors. Feedback forms were completed prior to the luncheons in order to achieve the highest response rate. However, because a number of participating faculty members were unable to attend, these individuals were sent an electronic survey form. The response rate for mentees was 92%, and 85% of the mentors completed the survey. Satisfaction was rather high with an average rating for mentees between moderately and very satisfied; the mentors were moderately satisfied. Although there were a number of suggestions, neither the mentees nor mentors agreed upon a single format for improving the committees. There was a great deal of agreement between the mentees and mentors regarding the methods they used to communicate beyond the committee meetings, and a fair amount of agreement on the topics that were discussed. Most of the mentees and almost half of the mentors felt that the greatest benefit of having an interdisciplinary committee was that it broadened the mentees' networks, helping them to understand the culture of the campus and learn how things work University-wide. There were few drawbacks for the mentees, but the greatest drawback for the mentors involved scheduling conflicts. Changes on the INC Program are being considered by Dr. Munley with the help of the ADVANCE Project Manager, Marci Levine. Two phone calls with the external evaluator have taken place. On her suggestion, the internal evaluator is interviewing the deans and the search committee chairs for recent hires. The purpose of these interviews is to get feedback on their discussions with the Vice Provost on Academic Diversity about hiring a diverse faculty, and to document if, and how, the college guides faculty search committees in this regard. Interviews are taking place in August and September. The internal evaluator has been in meetings with the Project Manager to review and refine the logic model and to supplement the assessment indicators to be able to provide internal feedback to STEM departments. Although the original evaluation timeline intended for the third-year survey to be administered in April 2013, plans are underway to collect the data in the fall of 2012 so results will be available for the NSF site visit in February 2013. Finally, on reviewing tables submitted in the annual report, although the numbers reported were accurate, the calculations of several percentages regarding archived data on hiring in Appendix 5 were incorrect. The correct percentages of women hired in 2006-07 were 45.8%, 2007-08 was 25.8%, 2008-09 was 24.0%, and 2009-10 was 17.4%. This has been corrected in Appendix 5 and will be reflected in future reports. Also, the figures for 2011-12 will be updated to reflect the five additional hires that occurred after March 31, 2012 of STEM faculty who will be starting in the 2012-13 academic year.

VI. Personnel Update

Over the summer it was determined that because of some changes to programs and deliverables, the intensity of evaluation and especially institutional data collection required additional time than currently available to us through our part time internal evaluator. Therefore, we agreed to add an additional 10% effort to Jean Russo's existing effort and to also utilize a social science research assistant hourly at about \$16/hr for no more than 10 hrs per week this semester.

There are no other staffing or co-PI changes to report this quarter. Some changes (in co-directorship) are anticipated for Spring 2013, after the third year site visit.