

Interim Report for NSF ADVANCE Program, September 1-November 30, 2012
Lehigh ADVANCE: Building Community Beyond Academic Departments
Due (Saturday) 12-1-2012, Submitted (Friday) 11-30-2012

I. Significant Accomplishments: Project Activities

A. Social Science Research: Gender and Interdisciplinarity

As reported in early September, the Social Science Research Team has completed in-depth analyses of the responses from 10 research-intensive mid-sized universities to answer our research questions about gender and interdisciplinary research. From a detailed initial results report, a manuscript exploring the hypothesis that women benefit from interdisciplinary environments (including examining affiliation with centers and programs independent of and together with departments is in draft form and two additional papers are planned. One focuses on the analysis of work-life balance questions as they relate to conducting interdisciplinary and collaborative scholarship, and the other involves a more structural approach, taking into consideration important institutional factors (the existence of certain policies, whether the school is an ADVANCE institution, the proportion of women in a home department).

Key findings continue to be shared in appropriate venues; including discussions with colleges, departments, department chairs breakfast meetings, and search committee chairs.

B. Women in Science and Engineering (LU-WISE) and Lehigh Open Access Database (iWISEN)

Starting this year, LU-WISE has begun its expansion to the Lehigh Valley region, with LVAIC (Lehigh Valley Association of Independent Colleges) faculty starting to participate in WISE programs. This was described in some detail in our previous report.

The Lehigh Women in Science and Engineering were invited to interview sessions with External Evaluator Christine Pribbenow on September 27th as part of her mid-grant visit. Check # of STEM women participated in this process (some are part of LT or IAC)

Another opportunity for Lehigh's WISE took place on October 19th during the Women, Gender, Sexuality Studies Faculty Research Forum discussion (see item C).

Lehigh ADVANCE provided travel support for ISE's speaker Margaret Brandeau, Stanford on October 26, 2012 and sponsored a luncheon during which five STEM women faculty members had the chance to interact less formally and talk about issues ranging from Dr. Brandeau's scholarship to building collaborations.

The development of the iWISEN database continues, with Project Manager Marci Levine working with College and University level Library Technology Services individuals. The back-end of the database is being specially created for ADVANCE given constraints in enhancement and compatibility with existing (and incomplete) faculty databases.

C. Women, Gender, and Sexuality Studies Program

The **Women, Gender, and Sexuality Studies (WGSS) Program** (formerly Women's Studies) continued to have monthly retention gatherings attended by women faculty across the College of Arts and Sciences and RCEAS. Two key collaborative events took place this semester and are described here below:

1) ADVANCE Chair Jill Schneider presented a draft and overview of “Faculty Recruitment Informational Module” on October 19 in which 10 women faculty from STEM and Non-STEM disciplines participated. Attendees expressed that some of this material was urgently needed and they will take it back to their departments. The feedback from this presentation was used to edit the presentation. The goal of this phase of development is to build buy-in from multiple stakeholders that best practices to minimize the negative impact of unconscious biases can be learned, and thus we can develop an instrument to complement the other resources (workshops, guidance documents) on campus.

2) At the June 1, 2012, ADVANCE Retreat, the Leadership Team agreed that a useful point of discussion with faculty would be the topic '*gendering of service*'. To that point, CAS Dean Donald Hall agreed to lead a discussion around this topic. This workshop/discussion was held on November 19, <https://advance.cc.lehigh.edu/content/workshop-service-gender-and-promotion> and pre-reads were recommended to anchor the discussion when associate professors, department chairs, deans, and promotion committee members were invited. Twenty-nine faculty attended, including associate professors and full professors; 15 were from STEM fields (10 women) and the RCEAS Dean David Wu was also present. The feedback from this program is still being compiled. As a follow-up to this workshop discussion, Dana Britton of Rutgers University has agreed to speak in spring 2013 to talk about her work on women moving from associate to full professor.

D. Recruitment Strategies

Description	ALL Fields	STEM		
Assistant	20	11		
Assistant/Associate	2	2		
Associate/full	5	4		
Professor & Chair	1	0		
Total TT	28	16		
POP	4	4		
Total People	32	20		
total search committees	31	19		
total TT search committees	27	15		
College	All Fields		STEM	
	All	TT	All	TT
RCEAS	15	12	15	12
CAS	9	8	4	3
CBE	6	6	1	1
CoE	2	2	0	0
TOTAL	32	28	20	16

The table to the left summarizes the recruitment goals for AY2012-2013. During this quarter, the Vice Provost for Academic Diversity, Henry Odi, met with each of the 27 tenure track (TT) search committees (two are recruiting for two positions and 15 are in STEM disciplines) to provide guidance in diversifying the candidate pool and to discuss other best practices.

A new university-wide guidebook for faculty searches (see details in previous quarterly report) was completed and [published online](#) September 28, 2012 where the [PDF](#) is also available for download. During the Provost’s Office presentation of the November 8th University Faculty meeting, Dr. Odi reviewed the availability of this comprehensive resource, which joins the Fall 2011 Best Practices booklet as part of our Phase I tools

for educating Lehigh faculty on recruitment practices. About 50 faculty attended the faculty meeting during which it is reported that the Guidebook was praised as being an important contribution to the university and contains valuable information.

Workshop: On September 28, 2012 Lehigh hosted The Cornell Interactive Theatre Ensemble (CITE) as they performed two sessions of the program “*Effective Faculty Search Process -- It Depends on the*

Lens: Unconscious Bias in the Faculty Search Process." Approximately 60 faculty attended the event including department chairs, faculty search committee members, and the Dean of Arts and Sciences. An evaluation was prepared and is reviewed below by the internal evaluator.

Best New Ideas:

1) Case Studies Discussions: As a follow-up to this workshop program, the Leadership Team and IAC have proposed a case study panel discussion of past searches comparing and contrasting those that were not successful in securing a commitment from the top female candidate to whom an offer was made.

2) ADVANCE was asked to help a faculty member edit his email message to colleagues to help advertise an open position and express interest in diversifying our faculty. One example was put forward from ADVANCE Chair Kristen Jellison (who is also running a faculty search committee). Marci Levine reached out to members of the AIM network for additional guidance. It was recognized that this type of specific and tangible help is what is needed. It is not always clear WHAT a faculty member should say in the letter when they are reaching out to their network. From this experience, we have placed [Broaden the Pool: sample letter asking colleagues to help identify applicants](#) on the Lehigh ADVANCE website.

3) Connect with RCEAS Search Committees: An outcome of the November 10, 2012 Leadership Team Meeting was the suggestion that ADVANCE should engage with RCEAS Search Committees, particularly on the topic of the evaluation matrix and knowledge of bias in letters of recommendation BEFORE candidates are invited to campus in the spring semester. Initially, it was proposed to gather the Search Committees to one event, but timing is likely to be prohibitive. Dean Wu followed up and asked the RCEAS Search Committees to invite ADVANCE LT representatives (Marci Levine and likely one other participant) to their next SC meetings. This will help deliver additional practical and tangible advice to committees at a critical phase of their searches (evaluating candidates and preparing for the interviews).

Online Tutorial for Search Committee Members: The development of this tutorial was described in the previous quarterly report. To gain feedback on the content, organization, and implementation of this tool, a pair of sessions were organized for October 29 and 30, but due to Hurricane Sandy, these have been rescheduled for December 3 and December 6. A series of email reminders to members of search committees, department chairs and deans has gone out. Thus, we are still fine-tuning this tool, and expect that it will supplement and reinforce the lessons learned from the CITE workshop and those encompassed in the University –Wide Handbook.

Ongoing Efforts: The ADVANCE Leadership Team continues to communicate directly with Academic Deans and Departments that ADVANCE is available as a resource for understanding recruitment best practices and internal data and trends important to decision-making.

2011-2012 Search Outcomes: Details were provided last quarter. An update is that we have just recently been informed that the woman who had accepted the offer from the Physics Department has notified the University that she will not be coming. Her home institution made her a counter-offer that she accepted.

E. Lehigh ADVANCE Small Grants Programs

We are continuing to advertise both the collaborative/leadership award and the recruitment seminar award programs and discuss their utility with departments, especially as we reinforce the idea of long-range networking to build diverse recruitment pools. This semester we are funding travel for six speakers through Faculty Recruitment Awards in the following departments: Earth and Environmental Sciences, two in Industrial Systems Engineering, two in Chemical Engineering, and one in Mechanical Engineering and Mechanics. One woman faculty member, Svetlana Tatic-Lucic received support for participation in an international interdisciplinary conference to advance her networking and leadership in her field. Additionally, we agreed to support three faculty members to attend the Grace Hopper Women in Computing Conference. Summaries of the value of participating in the conferences are pending. We are pleased with this rate of support; funding 10 Small Grants per year was our initial budgetary goal. The Leadership Team can explore if additional support will be needed based on need.

F. Interdisciplinary Networking Committees

The Interdisciplinary Networking Committee (INC) is the Lehigh ADVANCE initiative's mentoring model primarily coordinated through the Deputy Provost for Faculty Affairs office. This office also coordinates the University Faculty Mentoring Committee. Details for 2011-2012 were reported in our previous quarterly report. INCs for 2012-2013 are now established. The ADVANCE web site related to mentoring activities has been updated: <https://advance.cc.lehigh.edu/mentoring>.

In preparation for the October 26th Orientation of the new cohort of INCs, Marci Levine and Vince Munley used advice from last year's participants and worked with Jennifer Jensen, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Associate Professor of Political Science Binghamton University (SUNY) to fine tune a mentor map and a bookmark tip sheet and these resources were shared. At this orientation, three past mentees (all women, 2 in STEM) discussed what they got out of the program. Additional activities have been planned for INC groups to socialize this semester and also to address specific early career stage issues.

The AWIS program on mentoring relationships was postponed until January 2013. A save the date was mailed to INCs and Women in STEM on November 20th; a memo to all faculty is pending.

G. Review of Policy/Guidelines on Evaluating Faculty involved in Interdisciplinary Research and Teaching

The Interdisciplinary Policy/Guidelines Review Task Group, chaired by Deputy Provost Vincent Munley and including two ADVANCE LT members, two tenured STEM women, and several other faculty, presented their finalized recommendations for policy/guidelines changes to Provost Farrell and the Academic Deans at a Council of Deans earlier this year. The individual colleges are now considering the proposal, and the proposal is also being considered by the Faculty Personnel Committee.

II. Project Management and Organization

Leadership Team:

During the quarter, Project Manager Marci Levine has worked on preparations for the third year site visit, scheduled for late February 2013. Marci is the point and lead person in arranging the schedule for the visit and in facilitating the LT through development of the six-page report to be sent to the site visit team.

Co-PIs Sibel Pamukcu and Jeff Sands remained as co-directors this quarter, and have agreed to do so through the up-coming site visit. Diane Hyland and Jackie Krasas remained as Co-PIs and leaders of the Social Science Research Team.

The Leadership Team has been meeting regularly throughout the fall, approximately once every two weeks.

As previously reported, Marci Levine and Pat Farrell (Provost and ADVANCE PI) attended the JAM meeting June 12-15, 2012. Marci Levine provided a summary of important lessons learned regarding the site visit and shared it with the LT and IAC groups.

Internal Advisory Committee: The IAC and the LT met together for 90 minutes on August 27 and is included in the LT meetings on and December 10. Their objective is to continue to be involved in the next steps that support understanding how interdisciplinarity can enhance faculty diversity and to participate in development of the site visit materials.

External Advisory Committee: We will finalize plans for the next EAC meeting soon. As we started in our previous report, we would welcome advice from NSF on this matter (considering the February 2013 site visit).

ADVANCE Chairs: 2012 and 2013 ADVANCE Chairs continued to meet regularly, arranging the First LVAIC STEM WOMEN SYMPOSIUM, to be held on March 18, 2013. Speakers and Panelists have been invited, and in almost all cases confirmed. A draft web communication e-vite has been prepared. Initial planning for the 2014 Symposium is also underway.

Communications: No significant changes to the extensive detail we provided in the year two annual

Report and in our quarterly report of September 4, 2012. Communication within sub-teams of Lehigh ADVANCE and also from Lehigh ADVANCE to the larger Lehigh community and beyond is important and is increasing the visibility of our programs and mission. Marci works with coordinators and administrators across campus to share important information. A reminder memo to all faculty members advertises the availability of the ADVANCE program small grants and the continued availability of the recruitment seminar grants. The Web Site is updated regularly by Marci Levine.

III. Areas of Difficulty/Resistance

As stated previously, a continuing challenge is the disparate departmental climates at Lehigh, including several STEM departments that are completely or nearly completely male. We believe that open communication and coordinated actions and decisions across all levels of university leadership will be needed to address these issues effectively.

Additionally, this is the second time the end of the semester is impacted by a severe weather event. The timing of hurricane Sandy forced a compression of many faculty schedules and a delay in the delivery of some programs. Where possible, events were rescheduled for this semester, but some are being moved to Spring semester or redesigned. Even in the case of advertised events, faculty responsibilities to make up for the missing days on campus might reduce registered attendees (Nov. 19th Workshop on Gender and Service; The delayed feedback sessions on the information module on faculty recruitment, come to mind).

There are different amounts of support for really “branding” ADVANCE and ADVANCE themed activities in contrast to true institutionalization of the measures that will bring about transformation. The guidance from the external evaluator and the upcoming site visit and report will be helpful in finding the right balance at each stage of the remainder of the grant and for the program after the grant period concludes.

The idea of long-term networking to build future diverse pools is slow to take on in certain departments. This year, in his interactions with faculty regarding recruitment, Dr. Henry Odi has been emphasizing this tactic to successful recruiting this semester and endorses using the Recruitment Seminar Funding available to nurture relationships with rising scholars or existing faculty who are mentoring the rising scholars.

IV. Best New Ideas/ Online Resources

Our Best New Ideas continue to center around either ways to be efficient in engaging the various stakeholders on campus to build awareness and support or in the delivery of a resource that provides very practical guidance.

AWARENESS: The efforts of meeting with STEM Department Chairs from the summer (reviewed in our last Interim Report) were productive in reinforcing awareness of ADVANCE and ADVANCE’s goals on campus as well as clarifying what ADVANCE is not. Department chairs were told about benefits and opportunities available in their role as Department Chairs. ADVANCE Co-PIs and Project Manager continued this personal approach through visits to STEM department meetings, with a focus on the engineering departments (our STEM recruitment efforts are concentrated in RCEAS this cycle and our survey gives evidence that these departments would benefit from additional support). Thus far, ADVANCE has contributed to the RCEAS College Faculty meeting on September 24, 2012; the Mechanical Engineering and Mechanics faculty meeting on September 26; the Chemical Engineering Faculty Meeting on September 27, 2012; the Computer Science and Engineering Faculty Meeting on October 2, 2012; and the Industrial Systems Engineering Department Meeting on November 27. We are rescheduling the meeting with the Materials Science Meeting. We will be at the CAS college meeting on December 10 (rescheduled from November 5th following Hurricane Sandy). At each of these department meetings, data on the proportions of women graduating in the field and issues about recruitment have been discussed but we also make sure we discuss the idea of cultivating a climate to support women or other minorities already or soon to be on campus. This has been a successful way to reach faculty who have not attended some other events.

As a follow-up to the November 10, 2012 Leadership Team meeting, the RCEAS Dean asked his Search Committee Chairs to invite a representative of ADVANCE to their next meeting. Marci Levine will be scheduling those as needed. Enlisting faculty search committee chairs and department chairs to provide their feedback on the content and implementation methods for the draft recruitment information module

ONLINE RESOURCE: The mentor map was edited and added as an online resource. We also added to our library the University of Washington Interrupting Bias in Faculty Searches DVD.

[Broaden the Pool: sample letter asking colleagues to help identify applicants](#)

V. Project Evaluation

The external evaluator visited Lehigh September 27-28 2013. She interviewed more than 25 faculty and administrative stakeholders and observed the CITE workshops. We expect delivery of the report by December 10th, 2012.

Feedback on the CITE workshop was provided by 38 of the faculty participants who attended. Overall, the feedback was positive; the attendees found the sessions useful (average rating 4.1 on a scale from 1 to 5), and they learned a moderate amount from the three techniques used in the workshop: the DVD and interactive conversation with the characters, the discussion with multiple points of view led by CITE facilitator, and the presentation on unconscious bias research (averages of 4.3, 4.4, and 4.4 respectively using the 1 to 5 scale). When asked what they found most useful, many mentioned the candidate evaluation tool, as well as strategies for keeping discussions of candidates structured and for recognizing unconscious bias. Almost all would recommend this workshop to others.

The internal evaluator conducted interviews of two deans regarding their views on diversity and the recruitment guidelines in their colleges. All but one of the interviews of faculty members who served as search chairs in the 2011-12 academic year have taken place. The interview notes are being compiled and will be sent to the respondents for their approval before writing the overall summary. This is in accordance with the agreement with the IRB for Human Subject Approval for the interviews.

Feedback was collected on the October 26, 2012 Interdisciplinary Networking Committee (INC) Orientation Luncheon. Eight mentees and seven mentors attended. They understood moderately to very well the goals of the program, the need for and composition of networking committees, and their roles as members of the committee. They found the orientation to be moderately effective, and most useful information came from a panel of three mentees who participated in the INC Program last year.

Also in progress is the data collection for the Lehigh ADVANCE Progress Survey. The survey of STEM faculty was announced by the Provost in late October, and the online survey was administered on Tuesday, November 6. An email reminder was sent on November 12, and Department Chairs received emails on November 16 urging them to encourage the faculty in their departments to complete the survey. A second email with the link was sent on November 19. To date, 56% of the women and 43% of the men STEM faculty responded to the survey.

VI. Personnel Update

Over the summer it was determined that because of some changes to programs and deliverables, the intensity of evaluation and especially institutional data collection required additional time than currently available to us through our part time internal evaluator. Consequently, last quarter we reported that we would add an additional 10% effort to Jean Russo's existing effort and that we would utilize a social science research assistant hourly at about \$16/hr for no more than 10 hrs per week this semester. This arrangement worked well throughout the fall and we are able to support this in the spring semester if needed.

There are no other staffing changes to report this quarter. Current co-directors Sibel Pamukcu and Jeff Sands will be stepping down after the February 2013 site visit. Patrick Farrell, Provost and ADVANCE PI will manage final selection of a new director or co-directors.